

Rule of Law and Good Governance in Nigeria: Challenges and Cures

**Dauda Mohammed Atiyaye, Lawan Cheri, Mohammed Kaku, Ali Kele & Umar
Mohammed Goni**

Department of Public Administration
Federal Polytechnic Damaturu, Yobe State, Nigeria
Corresponding author: mkaku1970@gmail.com; mkaku@fedpodam.edu.ng

Abstract

Despite an advancement in science and humanities, Nigerian still struggle with the issue of development. Rule of law and good governance are the major features of any civilized society today. The rule of law is a liberty centred constitutional concept which stipulates that everything must be done in accordance with the law. The rule of law is fundamental and prerequisite for good governance. Good governance floats on the rule of law, while the good governance promotes and sustains rule of law. Nigeria today, struggles with ensuring that the law applies equally to all. Corruption and bad governance have planted seeds that have stumped the progress of the rule of law and in turn negatively impacted the standard of living and development of Nigeria. The objective of this paper is to find out the extent to which rule of law has influenced good governance in Nigeria. Secondary data, generated through articles, books, scholarly journals were used for the analysis. Our findings indicate that, in principle, rule of law are elaborately provided in Nigeria, but in practice, good governance still eludes the country. Corruption, poverty, ignorance, inflation, declining productivity, maladministration, dictatorship, ethnicity and other primordial factors, as well as prevalent social vices are the road mines to good governance in Nigeria. Equitable distribution of resources, provision of qualitative education, economic restructuring of the society, freedom of the press and political reforms, among other recommendations, are fundamental for the enthronement of functional rule of law for good governance in Nigeria.

Keywords: Rule of law, Good governance, Maladministration, Challenges. Nigeria.

Introduction

Introduction

The rule of law is a fundamental principle of democratic governance. It prevents the arbitrary use of power by ensuring that all actions of individual, and institutions, including the government are conducted within the boundaries set by law that are publicly promulgated. It also ensures these laws are equally enforced and adjudicated upon by an independent judiciary. Therefore, the rule of law is essential for protecting the rights of all citizens and ensuring, fairness, justice, equality and government accountability. In Nigeria, the rule of law is anchored on a Supreme Constitution which subjects all classes and persons including government and its agencies to its provisions. The Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999 (as amended) in section 1(1) states that “this constitution is supreme and shall have binding force on all authorities and persons throughout the Federal Republic of Nigeria.

This suggests that everything must be done according to the law, which applies to all classes of persons. The Constitution also ensures fair hearing of trials in all cases, and guarantees the preservation of rights. However, despite these constitutional guarantees, the rule of law is not fully practiced, creating uncertainty about Nigeria’s future. Challenges such as lack of

constitutionalism and constitutional supremacy, interference with judicial process, weak institutions, delayed justice system, disregard for court orders, lack of access to justice, corruption and human rights violations including, extrajudicial killings, arbitrary arrests and restriction of freedom of expression poses significant challenge to the rule of law in Nigeria.

These issues contribute to Nigeria's consistent low rankings on global rule of law indices, in the recent Rule of Law Index published by the World Justice Project (WJP, 2023), Nigeria ranks 120th out of 142 countries, scoring of 0.41 out of 10. Regionally, it ranked 23rd out of 34 countries in Sub Saharan Africa (p.136). The index offers data organized into eight factors that encompass the concept of the rule of law, such as constraints on government power, absence of corruption, open government, fundamental rights, order and security, regulatory enforcement, civil justice, and criminal justice. This situation is a deep source of concern due to its potential impact on the nation's stability and development.

As rightly observed Banire (2021) any nation, where rule of law is trampled upon cannot achieve substantial human capacity development or attract sufficient foreign investment that will drive it towards a prosperous future. The United Nations 2030 Agenda and Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 16 emphasizes the need to build peaceful, just and inclusive societies that are based on respect for human rights, effective rule of law, good governance, and transparent, effective and accountable institutions that provide access to justice for all (United Nations Development Programme, 2022, p.10). Given the profound implications of weak rule of law on Nigeria's stability and development, this paper underscores the imperative of advancing the rule of law for the enhancement of good governance and attainment of socio-economic and political stability in Nigeria.

Conceptual Review

The Concept of Rule of Law

The rule of law has been broadly defined as a principle of governance in which the government and the people are accountable to laws that are publicly known, equally enforced, and independently adjudicated, and which are consistent with international human rights norms and standards. "It requires, as well, measures to ensure adherence to the principles of supremacy of law, equality before the law, accountability to the law, fairness in the application of the law, separation of powers, participation in decision-making, legal certainty, avoidance of arbitrariness and procedural and legal transparency (Robert A. Stein, 2019) It has also been simply defined as a system where government officials and citizens are bound by and abide by the rule of law (Brian, 2012). The rule of law simply means that law rules or reigns (Nwabueze, 2007).

The idea of rule of law is regarded as part of modern democratic governance. It protects the rights of all citizens and ensures that the government is accountable to the people. It also provides a framework for resolving disputes peacefully and fairly (Ojukwu, in Omobola, D. (2023). According to the United Nations (2008, p.1), the rule of law refers to a principle of governance in which all persons, institutions and entities, public and private, including the State itself, are accountable to laws that are publicly promulgated, equally enforced and independently adjudicated, and which are consistent with international human rights norms and standards. It requires, as well, measures to ensure adherence to the principles of supremacy of law, equality before the law, accountability to the law, fairness in the application of the law, separation of

powers, participation in decision-making, legal certainty, avoidance of arbitrariness and procedural and legal transparency.

In Dicey's position; Rule of law is the absolute supremacy or predominance of regular law as opposed to the influence of arbitrary power and excludes the existence of arbitrariness, prerogative or even of rule of wide discretionary authority on the part of government ... a man may be punished for a breach of law but he can be punished for nothing else (Dicey, 1885). Dicey emphasized three aspects of the rule of law: No one can be punished or made to suffer except for a breach of law proved in an ordinary court; No one is above the law and everyone is equal before the law regardless of social, economic, or political status; and the rule of law includes the results of judicial decisions determining the rights of private persons.

The principles of the rule of law can be summarized into six main points. The first principle is the superiority of the law. This means that the government and the people are limited by the law. The law must govern the man and the state. The second principle is that the laws must be known and predictable. The law must be set forth in advance and must also be understandable. The third principle is that the laws must be enforceable. The laws imposed cannot be impossible for the people to meet. The fourth principle is separation of powers. This principle ensures that there is separation of powers among each arm of government. The fifth principle is equal application. This principle recognizes that the law may treat classes of persons differently but requires that the different treatment have a rational basis. The last principle is just laws. This might be considered a substantive rather than procedural guarantee of the rule of law. It expresses the idea that laws in society that honor the rule of law must be just.

The Concept of Good Governance

Governance is the manner in which power is exercised in the management of a country's economic and social resources for development. It involves the traditions and institutions by which authority in a country is exercised. This includes, the process by which governments are selected, monitored and replaced; the capacity of the government to effectively formulate and implement sound policies; and the respect of citizens and the state for the institutions that govern economic and social interaction among them (World Bank, 2000). Good governance, on the other hand, refers to a set of practices and principles that promote effective and efficient governance. It is characterized by participation, adherence to the rule of law, transparency, responsiveness, consensus-oriented, equity and inclusiveness, effectiveness and efficiency, and accountability (United Nations, 2016).

The Mo Ibrahim Foundation (2022, p.7), a champion of good governance on the African continent, outlines four main pillars of good governance. This include security and rule of law; participation, rights and inclusion; foundations for economic opportunity; and human development. Furthermore, good governance ensures that political, social, an economic priority is based on broad consensus in society and that the voices of the poorest and most vulnerable are heard in decision-making over the allocation of resources. According to United Nations (2007), good governance encourages public participation in government, inclusion in law-making and policy making, and accountability of elected and appointed officials. It also enables civil society to become actively involved in policy making which leads to wide representation of societal interests in decision-making. Therefore, good governance result in laws and policies that better

respect cultural diversity contribution to the resolution of social conflicts and tensions, and address the challenges of inequality and poverty.

The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) classified governance into three (3) political, economic and administrative and defines the term as “The exercise of economic, political, and administrative authority to manage a country’s affairs at all levels. It comprises mechanisms, processes, and institutions, through which citizens and groups articulate their interests, exercise their legal rights, meet their obligations and mediate their differences.” According to the World Bank, governance means “The way power is exercised through a country’s economic, political, and social institutions.” (Kaufmann, D., et al 2007).

Good governance requires fair legal frameworks that are enforced impartially by an independent judiciary and its decisions and enforcement are transparent or carried out in a manner that follows established rules and regulation. Since accountability cannot be enforced without rule of law and transparency, accountability is a key requirement for good governance. The government, the private sector and the civil society must all be accountable to the public and their institutional stakeholder.

According to the UNDP, the characteristics of good governance defined in societal terms include the following:

- i. *Participation* - All men and women should participate in decision-making, either directly or representatives, such participation must be built on freedom of association and speech.
- ii. *Rule of law* -Legal frameworks should be fair and enforce dim partially, particularly the laws on human rights.
- iii. *Transparency* - Transparency is built on the free flow of information. Processes, institutions and information are directly accessible to those concerned with them, and enough information is provided to understand and monitor them.
- iv. *Responsiveness* -Institutions and processes try to serve all stakeholders.
- v. *Consensus orientation* – Good governance mediates differing interests to reach abroad consensus on what is in the best interests of the group and, where possible, on policies and procedures.
- vi. *Equity* - All men and women have opportunities to improve or maintain their wellbeing.
- vii. *Effectiveness and efficiency* – Processes and institutions produce results that meet needs while making the best use of resources.
- viii. *Accountability* -Decision-makers in government, the private sector and civil society organizations’ are accountable to the public, as well as to institutional stakeholders.
- ix. *Strategic vision* - Leaders and the public have a broad and long-term perspective on good governance and human development, along with a sense of what is needed for such development.

From the above one may surmise that the major components of the definition of good governance are namely: contestable political leadership, accountability and transparency of those in political office and the respect of basic guarantees of freedoms for the citizenry; with all acting within the confines of the rule of law.

One method of ensuring good governance is ensuring citizen participation in the governance process. It does not mean that the government must consult each and every citizen for every policy and decision to be made. Participation in good governance means that citizen has easy access to official information; there is an ongoing government policy to promote transparency

and continuous programs of engaging the public via public forum such as town hall meetings. Freedom of Information bill should be seriously considered by countries in Asia that will provide the legal route for citizen to obtain government documents. Thus, in strengthening rule of law and enhancing enforcement, a review of rules on preliminary investigations is also apt as it is a crucial part in any successful prosecution of criminal cases especially those involving corruption. Taking into account of postulates of rule of law by Lord Bingham and the IBA, it can be hypothesized that the very elements of good governance is the characteristics of rule of law itself.

Methodology

This study make used of in-depth content, historical and descriptive analysis of secondary sources of available literature such as text books, articles sourced from the library and from the internet on the concepts of rule of law and good governance. Furthermore, the study make use of empirical data of other published studies on the concept of rule of law and good governance in the African continent.

Discussion

As one of the characteristics of good governance, rule of law plays a pivoting role. Rule of law provides legitimacy and authority to the government. Rules and regulations provide the framework for action and decision making process. As said umpteen times, without rule of law, the quest for good governance will never be successful.

Irrespective of the fact that Nigeria as a state has laid down constitution expected to be supreme and strictly adhered to by all and sundry. It is however quite unfortunate that the reverse is the case at certain given circumstances and spheres. An instance in concrete situations where the Rule of Law is grossly challenged via its violations in Nigeria abounds viz:

The present democratic dispensation in Nigeria ensued on the 29th of May, 1999. In principle, Nigeria operates a democratic form of government, both in choosing the leaders and in administration proper. In practice however, it is seldom implemented. This then is contrary to the assertion of Plato that, democracy, the rule of law and good governance are the basic elements that are expedient for the existence of an "ideal state". Employing the Democratic form of governments implies that the rule of law ought to be in practice and realized in such a given state. Submitting to the rule of law as well, will definitely effects genuine democracy and good governance in the actual sense in any state. The truth still remains that, cases of election rigging especially by governments in power at certain period remains obvious.

In lieu with the above assertion, irrespective of the fact that Nigeria commenced the employment of democratic form of government since May 1999, yet little or no significant impact had been made by that on the socio-economic, socio-political, socio-Religious and the general well-being of the country and her citizens at large. This of course is so owing to the manipulative nature and character of the ruling elite. Thus from the postulation of the Elite theory, it is obvious that the "so called", Ruling Elites or Each government in power and its political party keeps infringing on the elections results to see that their candidates emerge the winner against the public mandate.

It is quite obvious that most times the peculiar government in power in Nigeria at each given epoch assumes the position of God. There exists several cases of unlawful dentations orchestrated by the government; gross abuse on fundamental human rights backed up by the

constitution especially as related to the freedom of expression; government disregard and disrespect for court orders, and the list goes on. The administration of Chief Olusegun Obasanjo between 1999 and 2007 had been described as the worst when it comes to compliance with the rule of law. He cited the instances of how despite the judgments of the supreme court on the feuds between the Lagos state government and the Federal Government over the failure to remit funds allocation meant for local government councils in Lagos; the defaulting party, which happens to be the federal government defied the court orders and went ahead in pursuing the case which was basically improper as if they are placing the judiciary in a tight corner to submit to their disobedience and rule in their favour: whereas, the constitution of the federal republic of Nigeria as amended (2011), stipulates that the reason for the constitution to be uphold is for: the purpose of promoting the good government and welfare of all persons in our country on the principles of freedom, equality and justice, and for the purpose of consolidating the unity of our people.

Describing the rate at which jungle justice is dispensed in Nigeria, Our society is barbaric, it kills the poor and praises the corrupt. Tyres and a keg of petrol are quick to surface when someone yells “thief” in a neighborhood. Within few minutes, a crowd gathers and descends on the “suspected thief”. His skull is cracked and his ribs are broken before his almost lifeless body is tossed into the flames. It is very rare to find a Nigerian who has not seen the charred corpse of a suspected thief killed by a mob. This, they do with total disregard to the federal constitution of Nigeria that stipulates under the fundamental human rights section 33; that every person has a right to life, and no one shall be deprived intentionally of his life, save in execution of the sentence of a court in respect of a criminal offence of which he has been found guilty in Nigeria.

However, the reason for actions as this is mainly that the masses have lost confidence on the police and the government. They upheld that bad governance, bribery and corruption and the law enforcements agencies irregularities pushes them to such actions. In Ayomide’s view, this jungle justice equally depicts the Nigerian citizens’ double standard in dealing with poor people who commit crimes and rich people who commit crimes. The most painful part of this jungle justice is that penalties undeserving a peculiar crime are passed on such crimes, thereby resulting in minor crimes receiving grave and barbaric sentences. There is no standard in dispensing justice and most times, innocent people fall victims of circumstances.

Meanwhile, cases of individuals that were killed in jungle justice abounds: The story of Aluu four, wherein four students of the University of Port Harcourt were horribly killed after hours of tortures. The bitter part of this story was that these boys were falsely accused (Ezea2017). The story of a boy that allegedly stole garri while, some maintained that he stole a phone and was later burnt alive by the mob in Lagos state as recorded. As he stopped to pacify the hawker, altercation ensued between him and some irate youth in the area, which pounced on him and beat him into coma. He died later in the hospital. The list goes on and on. All these are challenges to the Rule of Law in Nigeria. Jungle justice does not follow due process. These irregularities hamper the development of Nigeria greatly.

In all, the Rule of Law is simply projected mainly in principle in line with the instances afore-sampled. Even those that it lies in their jurisdiction to see to it that the rule of law is upheld equally abuse the legalistic stipulations of the rule of law. The law enforcement agencies especially the police most times go on arresting and detaining individual persons in an unlawful mode. This was exactly what once propelled the House of Representatives Committee on Human

Rights in 2018 according to Agency Report (2018), to mandate the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) to furnish it with the list of Nigerians unlawfully detained by the police. The House insisted on their forwarding these names owing to the fact that there are crime records in all the police stations in Nigeria: Especially of people who were arrested and kept beyond the constitutional timeline. This will keep the police on their toes and make them wary of the fact that they are being watched closely.

In the same vein, the judicial system itself passes judgments at times to buy the favour of the peculiar government in power. The judgment passed on the 2019 presidential elections tribunal had been described by the opposition party as a perversion of justice, and a direct assault on the integrity of the nation's justice system. One begins to wonder what the implication will entail for Nigeria where a court will rule that one only has to swear to an affidavit, detailing his personal information's, including academic qualifications in order to contest for a political position in Nigeria. Thus, irrespective of the fact that the party in power and some person's at the reins of government, who are benefiting from the government are applauding the judgments not minding its associated irregularities; one keeps wondering if this is actually the heartbeat of the citizens of Nigeria. According to Sahara Reporters, the Human Rights Association of Nigeria on their own condemned the judgment, stating that the Nigerian judicial system:

The Effects of the Abuse of the Rule of Law on Good governance in Nigeria

The major challenge to the Rule of Law from the findings of this work is simply the gross abuse and neglect to that rational stance that ought to keep a nation functioning. The resultant effects of these gross violations of the Rule of Law are as follows:

- i. **It facilitates and fosters a failed state:** A country where the Rule of Law is abused with max impunity; corruption, negligence, indifference, falsehood, unpatriotic, hatred, bigotry, violence, terrorism, vandalism, murder, lawlessness, and jungle justice will gain ascendancy. The government cannot resolve such set situations. Such a state is a failed state. This is presently the case in Nigeria.
- ii. **It produces a weak administration:** Abuse of the Rule of Law creates a state of Anomie. The citizens will no longer have confidence on the government and all within the corridors of power in such a nation. Lawlessness will abound while those within the reins of government will be striving towards enriching themselves and pursuing their whimsical and capacious goals. There is no way in the world such a government will bring stability to such a chaotic scenario. Cry for secession will be on the increase while various insurgent groups will arise. The citizens of Nigeria presently are embarrassing most political appointees and government officials in Nigeria whenever they travel outside the country. They even go to the extent of unleashing violence on them.
- iii. **It hampers growth and development:** Foreign investors may find it difficult to come in and invest in such a country while the citizens of such a country will always be on the move to travel beyond the shores and borders of such a country on the quest for greener pastures. This will definitely affect the economy of such a given state as is currently witnessed in Nigeria.
- iv. **It breeds insecurity:** One cannot boast of being safe in the hands of the police or the masses in Nigeria. Violence has graduated to terrorism and the country is in perpetual state of insecurity. The Fulani herdsmen barbaric killings, incessant that has gone rite, and kidnappings indiscriminate killing of the citizens by the law enforcement order personalities and so on typifies the level of insecurity in Nigeria.

Conclusion

The Rule of Law is a principle that is put in place to ensure that human greed, insatiable excesses for dominance, power and lawlessness is controlled. It is a tool for maintaining sanity and peace in the society. The Rule of Law is there to enforce the respect for the basic fundamental human rights by all and sundry. This implies that a society where the contents of the Rule of Law is constantly challenged by gross abuse of its precepts will simply become ungovernable, barbaric, uncivilized, parochial, unprogressive and lending leadership opportunities in the hands of a “dominance sect”: Nigeria is tilting towards the extreme end in featuring all these aforementioned ill-traits and misfortunes in her society.

Every society in the cosmos possesses the innate ability to harness their God given resources in a selfless, stance for the benefit of all in order to ensure growth and wellbeing of the society and her inhabitants. In maximizing the use of these resources and God given potentials; there is a need to ensure equitable allocations and usage. This is where governance comes in. In order to ensure good governance, peace, sanity and stability in the society, the Rule of Law should be upheld in principle and core practice. The challenges to the Rule of Law in the human society and Nigeria in particular is simply the result of materialism narrow mindedness, selfishness, greed, addiction for power, pride and other related vices. The historical and theoretical analysis proffered in this work combined with the corollary solutions will go a long way in effecting the respect and application of the Rule of Law in Nigeria.

Recommendation

- i. The in-depth research carried in the course of this work is spurring the recommendation for every citizen of Nigeria to learn to have confidence in God and God given abilities in their lives to survive as humans. They should learn to bring their rationality into focus in handling issues bothering on politics (choosing her leaders), national welfare, justice, law and order, economic activities, constitutions, policy making and in proper implementation.
- ii. This work strongly recommends that the citizens of Nigeria should learn to uphold dignity, good image and name, patriotism as against whims and caprices, and good legacy: They should internalize the fact that side talks, false accusations, character assassination, unlawful detention, and ingratitude can never write off good works. Good works is positive result oriented and beneficial to all and sundry.
- iii. Core democracy should be practiced in Nigeria: Not an indigenized or homemade democracy that features election rigging, unjust disenfranchisement of certain citizens, lies, irregularities and indecencies of the highest. Rather a democracy that upholds and promotes the basic tenets of democracy which includes amongst others: popular sovereignty, political equality of all citizens; free fair and frequent elections (frequent in the sense that it must be held often enough to enable the people to exercise their control of government); alternative sources of information (... will enforce freedom of the press); liberalism constitutionalism (the use of constitutions to limit government by Law). Military-Atavism, a situation wherein a military man after resignation or retirement will come up to context in a democratic government election should be discouraged completely. Military men should face their core duty and responsibilities as military men and allow the smooth running of the government for civilians. It is obvious from the findings of this work that some of the democratic presidents of Nigeria so far were once military men before being elected into office. Little wonder they employ mostly

- authoritarian form of leadership. This in turn leads to their gross abuse of the Rule of Law in various circumstances.
- iv. One method of ensuring good governance is ensuring citizen participation in the governance process. It does not mean that the government must consult each and every citizen for every policy and decision to be made. Participation in good governance means that citizen has easy access to official information there is an ongoing government policy to promote transparency and continuous programs of engaging the public via public forum such as town hall meetings. Freedom of information bill should be seriously considered by Nigerian government for citizen to obtain government documents.
 - v. Thus, in strengthening rule of law, enhancing enforcement including anti-corruption enforcement, the prosecuting body and the court is of utmost importance. This also includes improving investigative abilities of law enforcement agencies, for instance forming or improving forensic sciences by establishing forensic laboratory.
 - vi. A review of rules on preliminary investigations is also apt as it is a crucial part in any successful prosecution of criminal cases especially those involving corruption.
 - vii. Human Rights Commission has been the trend in most Asian countries especially after the worldwide economic crisis of 1997. This is well and good but the impending issue is how effective is the commission in safeguarding human rights and upholding rule of law. How independence is the body and the extent to which that they are not in consonant with any political party and in cohort with the government of the day? Therefore, any human right commission must not be a toothless tiger and they should not the tool of any political party or body to serve their own motive and objective.
 - viii. Those countries that have not established such commission should provide “the passage for a charter for the commission of human rights to perform a comprehensive monitoring function independently which will contribute to the strengthening of rule of law, government accountability and transparency.

References

- Banire, M. A. (2021, 28 September). The challenges of the judiciary in contemporary Nigeria. Paper Presented at the Annual Judges Conference of Ogun State Judiciary.
- Brian Z. Tamanaha , (2012)The History and elements of the rule of law, Sing. J. L. S. 233.12Id.
- Dicey, A.V, (1885) Introduction to the study of the law of the constitution, 10th Edition.
- Mo Ibrahim Foundation (2023). 2022 Ibrahim Index of African Governance – Index Report.
<https://mo.ibrahim.foundation/sites/default/files/2023-01/2022-index-report.pdf>
- Nwabueze, B. (2007). How president Obasanjo subverted the rule of law and democracy. Gold PressLtd.,38.Good%20Governance%20and%20the%20Rule%20of%20Law.pdf
- Omobola, D. (2023, October 2). Rule of law in Nigeria is weak – Ojukwu. Vanguard.
<https://www.vanguardngr.com/2023/10/rule-of-law-in-nigeria-is-weak-ojukwu/amp/>
- Robert A. Stein, (2019).What exactly is the rule of law.
- United Nations Development Programme (2022). Environmental justice: Securing our rights to a clean, healthy and sustainable environment. UNDP Technical Paper.
<https://www.undp.org/sites/g/files/zskgke326/files/2022-06/Environmental-Justice-Technical-Report.pdf>
- United Nations. (2007). Good governance for the protection of Human Rights. Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.
<https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/Publications/GoodGovernance.p df>

- United Nations. (2008). Guidance Note of the Secretary-General: United Nations Approach to Rule of Law Assistance. UN Secretary-General (UNSG). <https://www.refworld.org/policy/legalguidance/unsecgen/2008/en/68452>
- United Nations. (2016). What is good governance? United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific. <https://www.unescap.org/sites/default/files/good-governance.pdf>
- World Bank. (2000). Reforming public institutions and strengthening governance: A World Bank Strategy. World Bank. <https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/994411468766776323/reforming-public-institutions-and-strengthening-governance-a-world-bank-strategy>
- World Justice Project (2023). Rule of Law Index, 2023. <https://worldjusticeproject.org/rule-of-law-index/>